

# X-ray tomography for the control of high-Z impurities in tokamak plasmas



### Axel Jardin | N06 – NZ61 | 17-03-2022

Department of Radiation Transport Physics (NZ61) Institute of Nuclear Physics Polish Academy of Sciences (IFJ PAN), Krakow

#### 2

[K. Król PhD 28.03.2022] [J. Walkowiak PoP 2022]

[D. Mazon JINST 2022] [Y. Peysson IAEA 2021]

[A. Jardin IFJ 2020]

Background

### Zakład Fizyki Transportu Promieniowania (N06/NZ61)

Research: neutron/X-ray radiation, nuclear fusion, plasma physics

- ✓ Plasma Focus PF-24,
- ✓ Neutron generator,
- ✓ Neutron transport MCNP calculations,
- ✓ ITER neutron spectro. (HRNS), IFMIF-DONES,
- ✓ Fusion plasma diagnostics and X-ray imaging,
- ✓ <u>Collaborations:</u> CEA (WEST), IPP Prague (COMPASS), etc...
- ☐ <u>My post-doctoral researches in IFJ PAN since 2018:</u>
- ✓ Tomography methods for X-ray/neutron diagnostics [POLONIUM 2018 19]
- ✓ Impurity transport studies in fusion devices (tokamaks) [EUROFusion 2018 ...]
- ✓ Fast electron collisions with high-Z ions, current drive [HARMONIA 2019 23]
- Nagroda naukowa im. Henryka Niewodniczańskiego 2021:

"The development of soft X-ray tomography methods for experimental and theoretical investigations of high-Z impurities transport in tokamak plasmas"

The PF-24 device





□ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

□ The tokamak concept

**Radiation of high-Z impurities** 

**X**-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control



## Environmental constraints → limit global warming < 2°C</p> → limit CO<sub>2</sub> emissions < 3000 GtCO<sub>2</sub>



PAGE 4

World energy reserves ~10<sup>2</sup> years



# fusion reaction rate $\langle \sigma v \rangle$

### Fusion reaction rate for different reactants:

 $\rightarrow$  D-T easiest fusion reaction on Earth.



## Efficiency of thermonuclear fusion

Plasma energy confinement  $\tau_E$ 

$$\tau_E = \frac{Q_p}{P_{loss}} = \frac{3nT}{P_{loss}}$$

 $Q_p$  – internal plasma energy per unit volume,

 $P_{loss}$  – power loss density,

n – plasma density, T – temperature,

 $\tau_E$  – Energy confinement time

a measure of the plasma cooling rate in the event of switching off the heating systems

$$P_f \geq rac{Q_p}{ au_E}$$

 $P_f$  – fusion power density,



 $n\tau_E$  - quantity characterizing the quality of energy maintenance in the plasma

## Efficiency of thermonuclear fusion



T ~ 24 keV;  $(n\tau)_{min} > 10^{19} \text{ m}^{-3}\text{s}$  (D,T) (1 keV ~ 10<sup>7</sup> K)



Inertial confinement



Magnetic confinement



# Inertial Fusion: Laser ignition devices



# National Ignition Facility (NIF, USA)

[O. Hurricane (2014) Nature]



## Recent results on NIF (2020)



## Recent results on NIF (2021)



# Recent results on NIF (2021)

#### Nature article, 2021:

"roughly 700 times the generating capacity of the entire US electrical grid at any given moment." <u>https://doi.org/10.1038/d41586-021-02338-4</u>

#### A. B. Zylstra et al. (2021) Phys. Rev. Lett.

"We report new implosions conducted on the National Ignition Facility (NIF) with several improvements on recent work [...]: <u>larger capsules</u>, <u>thicker fuel layers</u> to mitigate fuel-ablator mix, and <u>new symmetry control</u> via cross-beam energy transfer" <u>https://link.aps.org/doi/10.1103/PhysRevLett.126.025001</u>

But concept still far from a fusion reactor...





[D. Batani, PhDiaFusion, 09-2021]

# Magnetic confinement fusion

### □ JET (Joint European Torus) Press conference (09.02.2022):

Record of fusion energy in one tokamak plasma discharge (59 MJ)



[M. Scholz, *"Recent results of the DTE2 experiment at the JET ILW"*, PEGAN seminar 02.03.2022]



#### https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=H99hvPlC4is





Figure 1 -  $P_{FUS}$  for DTE1 shots (black) with peak power and energy and  $P_{EQ,DT}$  for JET-ILW best sustained performance for hybrid (red) and baseline (blue) plasmas. The start time is adjusted to facilitate comparison.



### □ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

### The tokamak concept

□ Radiation of high-Z impurities

**X**-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control

# Tokamak – magnetic confinement

### Tokamak is based on magnetic confinement:

✓ Toroidal magnetic field created by <u>external coils</u>
 → trapping of particles in a torus-shaped vacuum chamber



## Tokamak – magnetic confinement

Nested magnetic

flux surfaces

PAGE 18

- Tokamak is based on magnetic confinement:
- ✓ Toroidal magnetic field created by <u>external coils</u>
   → trapping of particles in a torus-shaped vacuum chamber
- ✓ Poloidal field <u>self-generated</u> by plasma electric current
   → compensate for drifts and stabilize the plasma
   → control of the plasma current profile is crucial!





### **The Joint European Torus (JET)**, EUROfusion, Oxfordshire:



## Tokamak = Obwarzanek z makiem

### The Joint European Torus (JET), EUROfusion, Oxfordshire:

![](_page_19_Picture_2.jpeg)

# Plasma heating methods in tokamaks

- □ <u>Main heating methods in tokamak plasmas</u>:
- ✓ Central solenoid: plasma heating by Joule effect, transient.
- ✓ Electromagnetic waves: Electron / Ion Cyclotron Resonance Frequency (ECRH, ICRH)

![](_page_20_Figure_4.jpeg)

[D. Mazon et al., Nature Physics 2016]

![](_page_21_Picture_0.jpeg)

![](_page_21_Figure_1.jpeg)

## 

- $\Box$  <u>Optimize n $\tau_E$  in tokamaks</u>: low density n, high confinement time  $\tau_E$
- $\Box \quad \underline{\text{Efficient Fusion reactor}}: \text{ bigger is better (for energy confinement time } \tau_E) \\ \tau_E \sim I_p^{0.93} B_T^{0.15} P^{-0.69} n_e^{0.41} M^{0.19} R^{1.97} \epsilon^{0.58} \kappa^{0.78}$

![](_page_22_Figure_3.jpeg)

International Thermonuclear Experimental Reactor: ITER (under construction in France)

![](_page_22_Picture_5.jpeg)

→ First device with  $\tau_E$  > 1s in fusion relevant steady-state conditions. | PAGE 23

![](_page_23_Picture_0.jpeg)

- ✓ Disruptions: loss of confinement, heat / mechanical loads
   → Prediction, Avoidance, Mitigation
- ✓ **Plasma wall interaction**: wall erosion, heat flux (active cooling)

✓ High-Z (W) impurity radiation → avoid central accumulation

- ✓ **Diagnostics**: hardness to neutrons/heat flux → which technologies?
- ✓ Real-time control of fusion power and plasma stability
- ✓ **Tritium** cycle and retention in walls
- ✓ Burning plasma: **neutron load, energy extraction, Helium ashes** exhaust

### ✓ etc...

![](_page_24_Picture_0.jpeg)

### □ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

### □ The tokamak concept

### **Radiation of high-Z impurities**

**X**-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control

![](_page_25_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Joint European Torus (JET), Oxfordshire.

![](_page_25_Picture_2.jpeg)

 $T_e^{\sim} 10 \text{ keV}$ 

Line of magnetic field

**Plasma-wall erosion** 

Heat and particle fluxes from the confined region toward the wall  $\rightarrow$  erosion of plasma-facing components of the tokamak.

![](_page_26_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### Joint European Torus (JET), Oxfordshire.

![](_page_26_Picture_2.jpeg)

**Plasma-wall erosion** 

- ❑ Heat and particle fluxes from the confined region toward the wall
   → erosion of plasma-facing components of the tokamak.
- □ Migration of the sputtered impurities → Radiation in the plasma core → Degradation of fusion performances

## High-Z impurity radiation in plasmas

**\Box** Radiated power of impurities:  $P_{rad,Z} = n_e^2 c_Z L_Z(T_e)$ 

electron density (m<sup>-3</sup>)

Cooling factor of Z (W.m<sup>3</sup>)

28

Impurity concentration

□ Impurity radiation increases with atomic number Z (high-Z):

**Dominant radiation processes:** 

- Bremsstrahlung (free-free)
- **Radiative recombination** (free-bound)
- Line radiation (bound-bound)

![](_page_27_Picture_10.jpeg)

![](_page_27_Figure_11.jpeg)

![](_page_28_Picture_0.jpeg)

### <u>Modern tokamaks</u>: <del>carbon</del> (C) → metallic wall (Be, W) to avoid tritium retention

![](_page_28_Figure_2.jpeg)

Reduction of fuel absorption in the walls by a factor >10

![](_page_28_Figure_4.jpeg)

![](_page_29_Picture_0.jpeg)

![](_page_29_Figure_1.jpeg)

 $\Box$  A concentration  $f_w < 0.01\%$  is a requirement for a fusion reactor

## Diagnostic tools and actuators to control the tungsten core concentration are required!

![](_page_30_Picture_0.jpeg)

□ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

□ The tokamak concept

□ Radiation of high-Z impurities

**X**-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control

## Soft X-ray plasma tomography

□ Soft X-rays (SXR) in the energy range 0.1 keV – 20 keV can provide valuable information, through 2D tomography, on:

### Impurity transport,

(e.g. sawtooth crash Magnetohydrodynamic (MHD) activity, in ASDEX-U)

Magnetic equilibrium. (plasma positioning)

![](_page_31_Figure_5.jpeg)

![](_page_31_Figure_6.jpeg)

# The SXR tomography problem

#### Soft X-ray (SXR) tomography in tokamaks:

Recover 2D emissivity from line-integrated measurements, but:

 $\rightarrow$  limited number of lines-of-sight + noise,

→ Mathematically ill-posed inversion problem:

![](_page_32_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_32_Figure_6.jpeg)

![](_page_32_Figure_7.jpeg)

# The SXR tomography problem

#### Soft X-ray (SXR) tomography in tokamaks:

![](_page_33_Figure_2.jpeg)

- $\rightarrow$  limited number of lines-of-sight + noise,
- → Mathematically ill-posed inversion problem:

![](_page_33_Picture_5.jpeg)

![](_page_33_Figure_6.jpeg)

□ A priori info required as additionnal constraint to regularize the inversion process:
 → Challenging task, benchmark needed to develop robust inversion algorithms

Tikhonov regularization:
$$\boldsymbol{\epsilon} = ({}^{t}\mathbf{T}.\mathbf{T} + \lambda \mathbf{H})^{-1}. {}^{t}\mathbf{T}.\mathbf{m}$$
Tore Supra  
SXR diagnostic:H: regularization operator (impose smoothness) $\lambda$ : regularization parameter $SXR$  diagnostic: $\lambda$ : regularization parameter $Vertical$  $Vertical$ 

[A. Jardin, D. Mazon and J. Bielecki, Phys. Scr. 91 (2016) 044007]

## An example of reconstruction

![](_page_34_Figure_1.jpeg)

![](_page_35_Picture_0.jpeg)

□ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

□ The tokamak concept

□ Radiation of high-Z impurities

□ X-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control

## Impurity poloidal asymmetries

![](_page_36_Figure_1.jpeg)

# Tokamak experiments (EUROfusion)

### Investigations of the impact of heating schemes and poloidal asymmetries on the heavy impurity transport in AUG and TCV

Work Package Tokamak Exploitation (WP-TE, RT01)

- Analysis of <u>impurity injection experiments</u> on ASDEX-U (AUG) and TCV tokamaks, in different plasma heating schemes and plasma (D/He) composition [1].
- Impurity distribution reconstructed by soft X-ray (SXR) tomography. Prediction of power deposition and impurity asymmetry thanks to TORIC-SSFPQL [2] modeling.
- AUG: <u>Higher W content</u> and <u>stronger SXR asymmetry</u> in the helium discharge wrt. deuterium, confirmed by SXR and from the numerical model. *Prospect:* estimate W transport coefficients and correlate them with the level of impurity asymmetry.
- □ TCV: A transient up-down asymmetry was observed on TCV after impurity gas puff. Use of the code developed in [4] to study up-down impurity asymmetry due to friction forces on TCV is foreseen.

[1] WP-TE RT01, EUROFusion wiki. <u>https://wiki.euro-fusion.org/wiki/RT01\_2021\_reports</u>
[2] R. Bilato et al., Nucl. Fusion 51 (2011) 103034.
[2] A. Jardin et al., 47th EDS Conference on Placma Physics (2021) P3 1065.

[3] A. Jardin et al., 47th EPS Conference on Plasma Physics (2021) P3.1065.

[4] P. Maget et al, Plasma Phys. Control. Fusion 62 (2019) 025001

IPP

![](_page_37_Figure_11.jpeg)

![](_page_37_Figure_12.jpeg)

Figure. W impurity transport experiments on AUG

![](_page_37_Picture_14.jpeg)

Max-Planck-Institut für Plasmaphysik

![](_page_37_Picture_16.jpeg)

![](_page_38_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### □ ASDEX-U plasma discharges in helium (He) and deuterium (D) plasmas:

![](_page_38_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_39_Picture_0.jpeg)

#### □ ICRH-induced asymmetry in helium (He) and deuterium (D) plasmas:

![](_page_39_Figure_2.jpeg)

## Tokamak a Configuration Variable (TCV)

![](_page_40_Figure_1.jpeg)

 $\rightarrow$  Potential impact of asymmetries on the radial influx of impurities?

 $\rightarrow$  Studies foreseen to investigate the effect of friction forces.

[P. Maget et al, Plasma Phys. Control. Fusion 62 (2019) 025001]

![](_page_41_Picture_0.jpeg)

□ Fusion Energy & recent results (NIF, JET)

□ The tokamak concept

□ Radiation of high-Z impurities

□ X-ray tomography for monitoring impurity transport

- Soft X-ray tomography
- Impact of heating systems on impurity distribution
- Prospect for real-time control

# Prospect for real-time impurity control

### Control of W concentration?

- Reduce W sources (erosion)
- Higher pumping rate
- Avoid strong W poloidal asymmetries
- Central ECRH (pump-out effect)
- Shape plasma profiles: peaked T<sub>e</sub> (temperature screening)
- Trigger mitigating/flushing MHD: sawteeth (core), ELMs (edge)...

![](_page_42_Figure_8.jpeg)

### → Possibility of real-time X-ray tomography?

# Neural networks for SXR tomography

- □ Issue of traditional Tikhonov approach: computing time > 0.01 10 s
- ☐ Fast tomography for real-time control < 0.1 ms → Neural networks Neural Network: successive neuron layers connecting inputs and outputs. Neuron biases and weights are iteratively adjusted by training from a dataset.

![](_page_43_Figure_3.jpeg)

 [A. Jardin, J. Bielecki et al., Neural networks: from image recognition to tokamak plasma tomography, 2019 Laser and Particle Beams 1–5] Neural networks tests with artificial data

![](_page_44_Figure_1.jpeg)

## Neural networks experimental test

#### Controlled injection of tunsgen impurities in Tore Supra:

![](_page_45_Figure_2.jpeg)

→ Consistent with traditional Tikhonov method but fast enough for real-time control (< 0.1 ms)

[A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, M. Scholz et al, Acta Phys. Pol. A, 138 (2020) 626-631]

### Neural Network training on ASDEX-U (AUG)

### □ ASDEX-U discharge AUG#32773 $\rightarrow$ 1st half of discharge used to reconstruct the second half.

![](_page_46_Figure_2.jpeg)

TFM – Topic 10 | IPP Garching | 03-04-2019 | Page 47

 $\Box$  First typical case, peaked distribution  $\rightarrow$  reconstruction OK

![](_page_47_Figure_2.jpeg)

### $\Box$ Second case, HFS asymmetry $\rightarrow$ reconstruction OK

![](_page_48_Figure_2.jpeg)

![](_page_48_Figure_3.jpeg)

![](_page_48_Figure_4.jpeg)

#### TFM – Topic 10 | IPP Garching | 03-04-2019 | Page 49

![](_page_49_Figure_1.jpeg)

**1** Third case, hollow profile with weak HFS asymmetry

 $\rightarrow$  <u>reconstruction</u>: hollow shape OK, mismatch in poloidal distribution.

![](_page_49_Figure_4.jpeg)

<u>Perspective</u>: use convolutional layers more adapted for image processing, instead of full-connected neuron layers.

![](_page_50_Picture_0.jpeg)

A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, D. Mazon, Y. Peysson, K. Król, D. Dworak and M. Scholz, Implementing an X-ray tomography method for fusion devices, Eur. Phys. J. Plus (2021) 136:706, doi: 10.1140/epip/s13360-021-01483-z

A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, D. Mazon, J. Dankowski, K. Król, Y. Peysson, M. Scholz, Synthetic X-ray Tomography Diagnostics for Tokamak Plasmas, J. Fusion Energ., 39 (2020) 240-250, doi: 10.1007/s10894-020-00250-9

A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, D. Mazon, J. Dankowski, K. Król, Y. Peysson, M. Scholz, A. Kulińska, Ł. Marciniak, X-Ray and Neutron Tomography of Thermonuclear Plasmas, Acta Phys. Pol. A, 138 (2020) 626-631, doi: 10.12693/APhysPolA.138.626

A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, D. Mazon, J. Dankowski, K. Król, Y. Peysson, M. Scholz, Neural networks: from image recognition to tokamak plasma tomography, Laser Part. Beams, 37 (2019) 171-175, doi: 10.1017/S0263034619000296

A. Jardin, D. Mazon, F. Jaulmes, R. Bilato, C. Angioni, K. Król, D. Colette, G. Vogel, ASDEX Upgrade Team, TCV Team, and EUROfusion MST1 Team, Investigations of the impact of heating schemes and poloidal asymmetries on the heavy impurity transport in AUG and TCV, proceedings of the 47th EPS Conference on Plasma Physics, P3.1065, June 2021. http://ocs.ciemat.es/EPS2021PAP/pdf/P3.1065.pdf

J. Bucalossi (A. Jardin) et al., Operating a full tungsten actively cooled tokamak: overview of WEST first phase of Operation, Nucl. Fusion 62 (2022) 042007 H. Meyer (A. Jardin) et al., Overview of physics studies on ASDEX Upgrade, 2019 Nucl. Fusion 59 112014.

S. Coda (A. Jardin) et al., Physics research on the TCV tokamak facility: from conventional to alternative scenarios and beyond, 2019 Nucl. Fusion 59 112023.

J. Walkowiak, A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, Y. Peysson, D. Mazon, D. Dworak, K. Krol, and M. Scholz, Approximate atomic models for fast computation of the Fokker–Planck equation in fusion plasmas with high-Z impurities and suprathermal electrons, Phys. Plasmas 29, 022501 (2022)

K. Król, (A. Jardin) et al, Impact of partial screening effect on fast electron dynamics in WEST tokamak plasmas with high Z impurities, 47th EPS Conference on Plasma Physics, P2.1072, June 2021 http://ocs.ciemat.es/EPS2021PAP/pdf/P2.1072.pdf

Y. Peysson, D. Mazon, (A. Jardin, K. Król, J. Bielecki, D. Dworak, M. Scholz) et al, Effect of partially ionized high-Z atoms on fast electron dynamics in tokamak plasmas, IAEA FEC 2020 - The 28th IAEA Fusion Energy Conference, May 2021 https://hal.archives-ouvertes.fr/cea-03249410/

Y. Peysson, (K. Król, J. Bielecki, A. Jardin, M. Scholz, D. Dworak) et al., Lower Hybrid Current Drive in High Aspect Ratio Tokamaks, J. Fusion Energ., 39 (2020) 270-291, doi: 10.1007/s10894-020-00266-1

A. Jardin, J. Bielecki, K. Krol, Y. Peysson, D.Mazon, D. Dworak and M. Scholz, Study of the mutual dependence between Lower Hybrid current drive and heavy impurity transport in tokamak plasmas, 2020, IFJ Report No 2105/AP. https://www.ifj.edu.pl/badania/publikacje/raporty/2020/2105.pdf

D. Mazon (A. Jardin) et al., First GEM measurements at WEST and perspectives for fast electrons and heavy impurities transport studies in tokamaks, 2022 JINST 17 C01073

D. Colette, D. Mazon, R. Barnsley, A. Sirinelli, A. Jardin, M. O'Mullane, M. Walsh, Modeling a low voltage ionization chamber based tomography system on ITER, Rev. Sci. Instrum., 91 (2020) 073504, doi: 10.1063/1.5142909 51

![](_page_51_Picture_0.jpeg)

## Thank you for your attention